

Decision Maker: ENVIRONMENT & COMMUNITY SERVICES PORTFOLIO
HOLDER

For Pre-Decision Scrutiny by the Environment & Community Services
PDS Committee on:

Date: 5th February 2019

Decision Type: Non-Urgent Executive Key

Title: PARKING FEES AND INCOME REVIEW 2019

Contact Officer: Chloe Wenbourne, Acting Head of Parking Services
Tel: 020 8313 4647 E-mail: chloe.wenbourne@bromley.gov.uk

Chief Officer: Nigel Davies, Executive Director of Environment & Community Services

Ward: All

1. Reason for report

A review has been undertaken of the parking charges across the borough in line with the agreed Parking Strategy and benchmarked against inflation since prices were last increased in 2015. The report recommends charges for on and off street parking fees, including permits fees, changes to Bromley Zone A as well as proposed changes to parking controls in Sundridge Park Village car park and Biggin Hill.

2. **RECOMMENDATION(S)**

That the Environment Portfolio Holder agrees:

- The proposed parking charges as set out in Appendix One.
- The proposed permit charges as set out in Appendix Two.
- The proposed dispensation and suspension charges set out in Section 5.
- The proposed changes to Bromley Zone A Controlled Parking Zone, as set out in Section 6.
- The proposed changes to parking controls in the Sundridge Park Village car park and surrounding streets, as set out in Section 7.

- **The proposed changes to parking controls in Biggin Hill, as set out in Section 8.**
- **The decision regarding detailed design of the proposed new schemes, post-consultation, be delegated to the Executive Director of Environment and Community Services, in discussion with the Portfolio Holder and Ward Members.**

Impact on Vulnerable Adults and Children

1. Summary of Impact: The increase cost for both parking in a paid for bay or a parking permit may affect those that are financially vulnerable; however, these charges have been frozen for 4 years. There will be no changes to the disabled badge scheme, therefore parking will still be free for badge holders in on and off street payment bays.
-

Corporate Policy

1. Policy Status: Existing Policy: Parking Strategy
 2. BBB Priority: Quality Environment Safe Bromley Vibrant, Thriving Town Centres Regeneration:
-

Financial

1. Cost of proposal: Estimated cost (including one-off implementation costs and on-going costs) of £7.5k in 2019/20, £30.2k in 2020/21 and £11.7k from 2021/22 onwards
 2. Ongoing costs: Net additional income of Cr £354.1k in 2019/20, Cr £376k in 2020/21 and Cr £394.5k from 2021/22 onwards
 3. Budget head/performance centre: Parking Services
 4. Total current budget for this head: Cr £7.3m (controllable budget)
 5. Source of funding: Existing Revenue Budget
-

Personnel

1. Number of staff (current and additional): 14.5FTE
 2. If from existing staff resources, number of staff hours:
-

Legal

1. Legal Requirement: Non-Statutory - Government Guidance:
 2. Call-in: Applicable:
-

Procurement

1. Summary of Procurement Implications: Parking controls are managed and enforced under the term contract with APCOA, which is in the second year of a ten-year contract.
-

Customer Impact

1. Estimated number of users/beneficiaries (current and projected): All road users in the Borough
-

Ward Councillor Views

1. Have Ward Councillors been asked for comments? Yes Ward Councillors for Bromley Town, Shortlands, Plaistow and Sundridge and Biggin Hill are being consulted.
2. Summary of Ward Councillors comments: Comments received will be reported at PDS.

3. COMMENTARY

Pay and display / cashless Payment

- 3.1 Charges in all car parks and on-street parking bays have been frozen since 2015, therefore a review of all parking charges has been completed. The Council needs to ensure that the borough's parking charges are kept in line with inflation and that the charging is consistent with other local authority areas. The pricing is key to the traffic management of the Borough's streets as it will allow for a rapid turnover of parking where necessary or allow for all day parking for commuters.
- 3.2 There has been a general decrease in the usage of the car parks in the borough and whilst new schemes will be considered to meet the demand of local facilities, Officers do not expect the usage to increase again in the near future.
- 3.3 This adds pressure to meet financial obligations. This review outlines the income projections from the potential charges increase, accounting for a potential user rejection rate.
- 3.4 It is proposed that:
- A 10p increase per hour is introduced to all pay and display tariffs, both on and off street; therefore the minimum charge will increase from 40p to 50p per hour.
 - Premium locations with a higher demand, where the charge is currently £1.50 or more, will be increase by 20p.
 - Following a recent petition concerning Lebanon Gardens Car Park in Biggin Hill, it is proposed that the charges in this car park are not included in this increase, leaving the charge at 40p per hour, which will be the cheapest tariff in the borough.
- 3.5 Appendix one lists the full details of the proposed charges for all on and off street parking bays.
- 3.6 The projected income from this increase, with a rejection rate of 25%, is £530k compared to the 2019/20 budget, however as mentioned above, the decrease in car park usage and a decrease in the Penalty Charge Notice issue rate has added pressure to the Parking Services budget. Once the on-going net deficit for this budget is taken into consideration, it is projected that the overall net increase in income will be £250k.
- 3.7 The Council is still promoting the use of cashless parking in all paid for locations across the borough. There has been a general increase in cashless use by approximately 3% per month over the past year, however only 33% of drivers are using cashless payment options overall.
- 3.8 There are many benefits for the customer in using the cashless system over the pay and display machines, this includes confirmation of their payment, VAT receipts, the option to extend their parking time and a decreased risk of receiving a Penalty Charge Notice for overstaying their paid for time. The customer can also request to receive confirmation and reminder text messages. There is a convenience fee of 20p when using the cashless system.
- 3.9 The Council is also at an advantage by customers purchasing their parking session by the RingGo Cashless solution over purchasing a pay and display ticket. The benefits to the Council are there will be less risk of fake or foreign coins being used in the pay and display machines, less money in the pay and display machines so less risk of theft, and eventually there will be less cash collections required, which could have an impact on the contract price for this service. However there will be additional minor costs for debit and credit card charges.

4. Parking Permits

- 4.1 Bromley sets the price of its permits based on the cost of managing the scheme, including the cost of administration and the level of enforcement needed to ensure the scheme is effective. This is related to the hours of operation of the permit bays.
- 4.2 The prices for all permits have been frozen since 2015. There are currently two charge levels for residents permits; any restriction that is for 4 hours or less is currently charged at £40.00 for an annual permit and any restriction over 4 hours is charged at £80.00.
- 4.3 The differential in charging is to cover the extra costs of enforcement by the Civil Enforcement Officers.
- 4.4 The proposed charging for Resident, Business and Visitor Vouchers are in the below table:

Resident Permits	Current Charge	Proposed Charge
Restriction 4 hours and under	£40	£50
Restriction over 4 hours	£80	£100

Business Permits	Current Charge	Proposed Charge
Standard	£100	£125
Premium Locations	£225	£275

Visitor Vouchers	Current Charge	Proposed Charge
Restriction 4 hours and under	£35	£45
Restriction over 4 Hours	£35	£55

- 4.5 Currently a pack of 15 visitor vouchers is £35.00. Each voucher is valid for one day's parking, regardless of how long the CPZ restriction time is for. The charge currently equates to £2.33 per voucher, regardless of how long the vehicle is parked for.
- 4.6 It is proposed that two different charges are introduced for the residents that reside in a CPZ, one will be for CPZs that are restricted for 4 hours or less and the other will be for CPZs that are restricted over 4 hours.
- 4.7 The proposal sets out that residents that reside in a CPZ of 4 hours or less will have an increased cost from £35.00 to £45.00 per pack of 15 visitor vouchers. This would increase each individual voucher from £2.33 to £3.00.
- 4.8 The proposal sets out those residents that reside in a CPZ of over 4 hours will have an increased cost from £35.00 to £55.00 per pack of 15 visitor vouchers. This would increase each individual voucher from £2.33 to £3.66.
- 4.9 The proposal to add a second tier of pricing to the visitor vouchers is to add fairness and equality for residents of all CPZs. Under the current scheme, a visitor in a lesser-enforced CPZ would pay the same to leave their vehicle for a 2-hour restriction to a visitor parking in a 10-hour restriction.

4.10 The CPZs that would be affected by the higher visitor voucher cost of £55.00 are listed in the table below:

Area	Zone
Beckenham	BEC
Beckenham	F
Burnt Ash Lane	G
Camden Grove	N
Clock House	Z1
Copers Cope	R
Farnborough	WR
Locksbottom	E
Maple Road	MAP
Orpington	I
Walnuts Estate	WAL

please note: residents in other Town Centre/Community shopping centre areas are excluded from buying visitor vouchers and this will be unchanged.

4.11 Appendix 2 lists the full details of the proposed charges for all resident permits, business permits and visitor vouchers.

4.12 The table below sets out the estimated costs and income relating to the administration and enforcement of permit parking, if the proposed increases are agreed. It should be noted that the figures do not include the income and the costs associated with the processing and debt recovery of any PCNs that may be issued: -

	£'000
Expenditure	
Staffing and scheme administration	184.2
Contract enforcement costs	170.5
Non-controllable recharges	56.4
Total estimated expenditure	411.1
Income	
Residents permits	-356.4
Business permits	-51.1
Visitors Vouchers	-139.1
Total estimated income	-546.6
Total estimated net surplus	-135.5

4.13 The surplus for visitor voucher is mostly down to the removal of free visitor permits to over 60's as agreed in report ES15001 from January 2015.

5. Dispensation / Suspensions

5.1 In the last financial year, Parking Services had 693 requests for parking dispensations across the Borough. A parking dispensation is usually purchased by an organisation to allow their vehicles to park on the single yellow line during the restricted times, normally for workmen who need their vehicle close to the site to carry out the job.

- 5.2 These applications are received on line and are currently charged at £12.50 per week; it is proposed that this is increased to £20.00 per week. In comparison, Bexley Council currently charges £40.00 per week and Croydon Council charges £30 per day, plus an administration fee of £40.00, therefore this will still be a reasonable price compared to other local authorities.
- 5.3 In the last financial year, Parking Services has received 9,915 requests for parking suspensions across the borough. A parking suspensions is usually purchased by an organisation or resident to allow workman to park their vehicles in a restricted parking bay during the restricted times, this can be a permit bay, pay and display or limited waiting bay.
- 5.4 These applications are received on line and the charges are £10 for per bay suspension per week plus an administration fee of £25. It is proposed that the administration fee remains at £25.00, but the suspension fee is increased to £20 per week. In comparison, Bexley Council currently charge £40.00 per bay suspension per week and Croydon Council charges £30 or £40 per day (depending on the area of the suspension) and an administration fee of £40.00, so this is still at reasonable price when compared to other local authorities.

Dispensations	Current Charge	Proposed Charge
All Locations	£12.50	£20

Suspensions	Current Charge	Proposed Charge
Admin Fee	£25	£25
Suspension per Bay	£10	£20

- 5.5 A range of practical and statutory actions would need to be undertaken before the revised prices could come into effect, including a 21-day Notice of Variation amendment of the various Traffic Management Orders, machine software updates, tariff sign changes, amendments to the Ringo Mobile phone software and the Council's Web site would also need updating.

6 Bromley Zone-A Review

- 6.1 Currently the Bromley Town Centre Controlled Parking Zone (CPZ) Zone-A is in operation 7 days a week; on Monday to Saturday between 8:30am to 6:30pm and Sundays between 10am and 5pm. The main parking bays within the zone are;
1. Permit Holder Only bays
 2. Pay and Display bays, which are in operation at the same time as the Zone-A operational hours.
 3. Shared Use bays which allow visitors to pay and display and permit holders to park for free within certain times, shown as "conditions apply" on the signs.
- 6.2 The Shared Use bay condition is detailed on residents' permits and it allows Zone-A permit holders to park in these bays free on Monday to Saturday from 8:30am to 9:30 am and 4:30pm-6:30pm and all day on Sunday. In addition to this, additional "permit holders only 6.30pm-8pm" signs were installed on South Street, Ravensbourne Road, Ringers Road, Ethelbert Road and Church Road to free up Shared Use bays for residents in the evenings.
- 6.3 This became confusing to other drivers who were paying and displaying tickets up to 6.30pm on weekdays and assuming the bays were free afterwards (since the CPZ operational hours end at 6.30pm). This led to many non-permit holder drivers receiving PCNs for parking in the permit bays after 6:30pm. After receiving complaints from many drivers, the Council decided in June

2018 to stop enforcement of the shared use bays from 6.30pm-8pm, as the signs were evidently being misunderstood by drivers. As a result of bays not being enforced, the Council is now receiving complaints from residents who are struggling to find a place to park their cars from 6.30pm in the roads mentioned above.

- 6.4 In addition to this, the Council has been approached by residents of Aylesbury and Newbury Roads in the nearby Zone-C, who are unable to park their cars when they return home in the afternoon and evenings because of their close proximity to the new St Mark's Square development. The Council had promised to examine parking patterns here once the new development opened, which it recently has.
- 6.5 The review has the following aims and objectives;
1. To ensure that the signs within the Zone-A are clearly understood by both permit holders and visitors to the town centre
 2. To ensure a balance between the parking needs of residents and visitors
 3. To ensure flexibility or alternative options for drivers visiting the town centre in the evenings
 4. To ensure consistency of parking controls on roads within the CPZ
- 6.6 During the review, Officers considered retaining the existing restriction of Mon - Sat 8.30pm - 6.30pm (and 10am-5pm Sundays) on all roads and removing existing 6.30pm - 8pm restrictions on roads where they are currently. Although this would improve the consistency of signage throughout the zone, it would not solve the problem of residents struggling to park after 6.30pm.
- 6.7 Officers also considered extending the restriction in the whole of the Zone-A to 8am - 8pm but this might be seen as an extreme measure especially on quieter roads where evening parking restriction is not necessary.
- 6.8 This led Officers to propose a new **Zone-AA**. This zone would operate from 8am - 8pm and would operate in the following roads:
- Ravensbourne Road
 - Ringers Road
 - Ethelbert Road
 - Aylesbury Road
 - Newbury Road
 - High Street
 - Elmfield Road and
 - Elmfield Park
- 6.9 Although there are no Shared Use bays on the High Street, Elmfield Road and Elmfield Park, it is proposed to include them in the new zone due to increased demands for parking after 6.30pm in these streets, as there are more evening attractions in the town centre now.
- 6.10 The detailed design of this proposal includes;
- Reallocation of approximately 12 Shared Use bays on Ravensbourne, Ethelbert and Ringers Road to Permit Holder Only
 - Extension of the hours of enforcement of the bays in Aylesbury Road and Newbury Road to 8am-8pm and the reallocation of approximately 10 Permit Holder Only bays to Shared Use bays
 - Removal of 6.30-8pm restrictions on Church Road and South Street, which will remain in Zone-A
 - Increase cost of resident permits where Zone-C roads become Zone-A roads, due to extended hours of CPZ

- Proposed new Permit Holder Only bays on Hayes Road and Sanford Road to replace some of the Shared Use bays.
- 6.11 Consultation is currently ongoing with both Shortlands and Bromley Town Ward Councillors, who are supportive of the proposals. The next stage in this process will be to consult with the public. It should be noted that it might be necessary to make further changes following feedback received from the public.
- 6.12 It is recommended that the decision regarding detailed design of the scheme, post-consultation, be delegated to the Executive Director of Environment and Community Services, in discussion with the Portfolio Holder and Ward Members.
- 6.13 The implementation date is expected to be July 2019. The one-off cost of the changes will be £7,000, which includes the purchase and installation of one pay and display machine, the Traffic Management Order as well as new signage and refreshed lines. There will be an on-going contract costs of £710 for the maintenance of the machine and cash collections. It is expected that this will generate additional income of £14.2k in 2019/20 and £19.1k from 2020/21 onwards.

7 New Pay and Display Scheme at the Sundridge Park Village Car Park (in Cooden Close, Plaistow and Sundridge Ward)

- 7.1 Prior to 2011 the Sundridge Park Village car park was a free facility, requiring a subsidy of about £6.7k p.a. mainly to cover the cost of Business Rates. In order to reduce this deficit a decision to introduce charges for the Sundridge Park Village car park was taken by the Environment Portfolio Holder in April 2011. In light of the continued cost of the free facility, the decision to introduce charges was subsequently confirmed by the Executive.
- 7.2 The car park had low usage by shoppers, compared with usage either by commuters and people working locally, both prior to the introduction of charges and afterwards. Charging commenced in September 2011 at £3 per day. A reduction in usage of the car park followed, with displacement onto nearby residential streets. Local residents complained of increased commuter parking and in January 2012 a questioner/survey was undertaken involving those residents living in the surrounding roads including Lansdowne Road, Minster Road, Edward Road, Lodge Road, Garden Road and Lawn Close. Residents were asked about the effect of charging at Plaistow Road car park, and any views they had about the introduction of additional parking restrictions. The findings showed that where parking problems were reported they stemmed from the introduction of charging at Plaistow Road Car Park, and residents favoured returning the car park to free use rather than the introduction of new parking restrictions.
- 7.3 The cost of managing the car park was approximately £4.3k p.a. which covered enforcement, cash collections, the supply of tickets and maintenance of the machine, as well as signs and lines. This cost is only incurred because we were charging i.e. it is not paid to the contractor whilst the car park is free.
- 7.4 Even after the introduction of charges the facility continued to make a substantial financial loss of about £6k p.a., together with the opportunity cost of not using the land for other potential purposes.
- 7.5 A reduction in the daily charge to £1 was then introduced to try to encourage commuters back into the car park, but this had only limited success. However, it always takes several months for parking patterns to return to normal and this was not allowed for.

- 7.6 Taking into consideration the views of residents and the increase in street parking the introduction of charging had caused, and that the marginal income generated from charging still did not cover the costs, it was decided in 2013 to remove the charges for parking at this car park.
- 7.7 However, for some time now the car park has been full with commuter vehicles Monday to Friday who use Sundridge Park railway station. A survey in January 2019 showed that there were on average 72 vehicles parked out of a total of 77 parking spaces, so the car park is 93.5% full. It is very unusual to have a free car park to serve commuters in the Borough and the car park continues to cost the Council to maintain.
- 7.8 The car park surface has seen deterioration over the last year and the January survey noted that the surface is badly in need of re-surfacing. Though weather conditions are a factor the high volume of traffic using the facility would also play an important part in the way the surface has worn. The cost to carry out resurfacing works here has been estimated at £41,457 which will be carried out in the 2019 / 2020 financial year.
- 7.9 It is important that car parks are self-financing so the cost of repairs are paid for by the users of the facility.
- 7.10 It is recommended that a Monday to Friday only tariff (Saturdays and Sundays free) be introduced at the Sundridge Park Village car park at 50p per hour, £2.50 maximum per day, which is the same tariff as Penge East and Lennard Road which are both commuter car parks. One-off costs of £4,000 will be incurred for the purchase and installation of one pay and display machine and for the associated signs and traffic management order. It is estimated that there will be additional on-going contract costs of £8,600 to manage and run the car park.
- 7.11 Since 2013 additional parking controls have been put in nearby residential streets to address the issue of commuter parking, but it is recommended that a review of parking in the vicinity of the Sundridge Park Village car park be undertaken before any charges are brought into effect in the car park. In light of this, it is expected that charges will not be introduced until the end of this year.
- 7.12 It is recommended that the final design of both the parking controls in the residential roads and the details of the car park charging be delegated to the Executive Director of Environment and Community Services, after discussions with the Portfolio Holder and Ward Members.
- 7.13 The implementation date is expected to be April 2020 following consultation and design work.
- 7.14 The table below provides details of the budget and proposed changes for Sundridge Park Village car park:-

	2020/21	2021/22
	£'000	£'000
Current budget for business rates	8.9	8.9
Expenditure		
One-off costs	4.0	0.0
On-going costs		
Business Rates	8.9	8.9
APCOA contract costs	8.1	8.1
Dr/Cr card charges	0.5	0.5
Estimated income	-23.4	-23.4
Total net costs	-1.9	-5.9
Net additional surplus/cost	-10.8	-14.8

8 New Pay and Display Scheme for Main Road, Biggin Hill

- 8.1 Long term on street parking can have an impact on the turnover of spaces near shopping parades and other local amenities. Historically, Bromley has installed time limited parking bays near shopping parades to help assist turnover. These bays display a maximum time a driver can park on street and therefore have to move the vehicle within that period. However, enforcement for such time limited bays is often very difficult and often drivers simply move from one bay to another over a daily period, not allowing any turnover. Without turnover, passing trade can become less frequent for local shops and businesses.
- 8.2 Other smaller shopping parades have remained unrestricted and again this can result in long term on street parking. Over the years a number of locations that have experienced similar issues have benefited from Pay and Display parking. During a Pay and Display review a number of sites located around shopping parades were identified where new Pay and Display was provided. However, Pay and Display parking has never been introduced in Main Road Biggin Hill by the shops, and the time-limited parking controls currently in place are proving very difficult to enforce, resulting in long-term parking in many of the bays by these shops.
- 8.3 It is recommended that a Pay and Display scheme be consulted on for Main Road Biggin Hill. Although the final design might change subject to consultation, it is currently proposed that 45 bays be introduced. The introduction of new Pay and Display in these locations is likely to generate an estimated £16,300 per annum income, as well as providing increased turnover in parking.
- 8.4 It is recommended that the final design of any Pay and Display scheme for Main Road Biggin Hill be delegated to the Executive Director of Environment and Community Services, after discussions with the Portfolio Holder and Ward Members.
- 8.5 The implementation date is expected to be April 2020 following consultation and design work. The one-off cost of this scheme will be £14,500, this will cover three Pay & Display machines, the Traffic Management Order, signs and lines. It is expected that there will net additional income of £13,900.

9 IMPACT ON VULNERABLE ADULTS AND CHILDREN

The increase cost for both parking in a paid for bay or a parking permit may affect those that are financially vulnerable; however, these charges have been frozen for 4 years. There will be no

changes to the disabled badge scheme, therefore parking will still be free for badge holders in on and off street payment bays.

10 POLICY IMPLICATIONS

A range of practical and statutory actions would need to be undertaken before the revised prices could come into effect, including a 21-day Notice of Variation amendment of the various Traffic Management Orders, machines software updates, Tariff sign changes, amendments to the Ringo Mobile phone software and the councils Web site would need updating.

11. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

11.1 The table below summarises the financial impact of the changes to parking controls with in the Bromley A zone, Biggin Hill and Sundridge Park Village car park: -

	2019/20	2020/21	2021/22
	£'000	£'000	£'000
One-Off implementation costs	7.0	18.5	0.0
On-going additional costs	0.5	11.7	11.7
Estimated income	-14.2	-58.8	-58.8
Net impact of changes to parking controls	-6.7	-28.6	-47.1

11.2 The estimated net effect of the proposals in this report is summarised in the table below and takes account of the on-going net deficit of parking income:-

Net financial impact of proposals	2019/20	2020/21	2021/22
	£'000	£'000	£'000
On and Off street parking increase of 10p	-250.0	-250.0	-250.0
Impact of increase of permit fees	-47.1	-47.1	-47.1
Impact of increase of dispensations/Suspension charges	-50.3	-50.3	-50.3
Net impact of changes to parking controls	-6.7	-28.6	-47.1
Total net impact of proposals	-354.1	-376.0	-394.5

12. LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

To implement these changes, amendments to both the on and off-street parking place orders will be needed as well as a 21-day consultation period to advertise the changes to the public.

Non-Applicable Sections:	PERSONNEL IMPLICATIONS, PROCUREMENT IMPLICATIONS
Background Documents: (Access via Contact Officer)	